



Transcript of Public Lecture:
A Feminist Conversation on Military Culture Change
Dr. Cynthia Enloe

TMC Network Annual Symposium
Saturday, February 18, 2023
MSVU, Halifax, NS

Eichler: My name is Maya Eichler for those of you who don't know me, I know most of you in the room do but we have a couple people joining. So, I'm a faculty member here at Mount Saint Vincent University, and I'm one of the co-directors together with Nancy Taber and Tammy George of the Transforming Military Cultures Network. So, we are hosting all of these events this weekend. Our Network has received funding from the Department of National Defense MINDS program, so we're grateful to have that financial support to be able to put on this event and have all these amazing conversations we've been having. So, we have already spent a day and a half now, I guess, critically reflecting, and having some, yeah, some, sometimes difficult, conversations about culture change, accountability, ethics, and social justice. And I look forward to continuing this with Cynthia Enloe.

I want to begin by acknowledging that we are gathered here today on unceded ancestral territory of the Mi'kmaq People and we've been talking a lot today about culture change across institutions. Mount Saint Vincent University, like so many other institutions, as well as the military, is grappling today with these questions, of reconciliation, decolonization, accountability. Our own university, which is a self-declared feminist university, has a history that connects us to the history of residential schools. The Sisters of Charity, which were the founders and the previous owners of Mount Saint Vincent University, had members who staffed the Shubenacadie Residential School in Nova Scotia.

They also had members who staffed the Cranbrook Residential School in British Columbia. Those schools closed in 1967 and 1970, respectively. Our apology from our former president Dr. Ramona Lumpkin came in 2021 only, many decades later, but we did have that apology and we're engaged in the ongoing work of decolonization and reconciliation. One of the students at the Shubenacadie Residential School was Rita Joe. I already mentioned her yesterday evening but I'll mention her again. We are honouring her this Heritage Day, on Monday, in Nova Scotia we're celebrating Heritage Day, and her most famous poem, I mean she wrote a lot of poetry, but the one she's most well known for is, *I lost my talk*. And so, if you're not familiar with that poem I suggest you look it up later and *I lost my talk*, you know, I think a lot of the conversations we've had over the last day and a half actually you'll find resonate very strongly with that poem, about losing one's talk and how to regain one's voice again. You'll also find Rita Joe commemorated on the Women's Wall of Fame, sorry, Women's Wall of Honour. I always want to say Hall of Fame when I think of the wall of Honour but it is the wall of Honour that's in the atrium, and she's in the top row, the second on the left, so if you haven't looked at the plaque yet about Rita Joe please do during the reception that's going to follow Cynthia's talk. The Women's Wall of Honour is meant to celebrate extraordinary women. And so, I think, you know, Cynthia Enloe's another extraordinary woman I was thinking and we're so lucky to have her here today.



So, Dr. Enloe was here last in 2015 and it's very generous of her to come back for another visit to Halifax.

She's a research professor at Clark University in Worcester, Massachusetts, and she works in the Department of International Development, Community, and Environment, but she's also affiliated with the Political Science Department and Women and Gender Studies. Now, for many of us, Cynthia doesn't require an introduction but I also recognize that there's a lot of people in the room who maybe are learning about her work for the first time, especially a lot of members of the defense team who are here today. So, I'll say a few words about what Cynthia's brought to the study of international relations. She's world renowned for bringing a feminist lens to the study of international relations, both the study of security issues and the study of political economy, and she's written so many books, I have asked the Mount bookstore to bring in, I think, five of her books, so afterwards, there will be some books for sale if you're interested to pick up a copy yourself. But Cynthia's really taught us about the need to be curious about where the women are in the international politics of militarization and she has always reminded us that it is really important to pay attention to where the women are to gain a more realistic picture of how militaries operate. And I really cannot think if anyone better to lead us in a feminist conversation of transforming military cultures. So, please join me in warmly welcoming Dr. Cynthia Enloe. Thanks for being here.

Enloe: Hi everybody. I have so enjoyed this last, was it day? It feels like, how long have we been here? Six months? I mean, doesn't it feel as though we've kind of been on the ship together for a long time? Anyway, I've learned so much. I've taken in new ideas; I've had old ideas shaken up and I just want to thank you. I really, I want to thank you all. You've really, you're my tutors and I'm very, very grateful.

I thought maybe... don't be nervous I actually did make notes. I was thinking back to a time when I was invited up to Labrador, to Happy Valley. Happy Valley's Labrador, right? And remember, I'm from Boston, what do I know, you know? But really, it was a group of Innu women who invited me to come to Happy Valley because they had been holding a demonstration on the runway of the NATO training base there. They were lying down. Innu women were lying down on the tarmac to stop NATO pilots from their training exercises because... do you all remember this? Some of you? NATO and Canada, with Canada's permission and organization of the base, the NATO Air Forces, all of the Allied Air Forces, were doing low-level flying training and the Innu women said, "Well there's several things that are really dangerous about this." First of all, it's very dangerous for wildlife and they talked a lot about, I mean, does NATO or Ottawa even know what the wildlife is here and what it means to traumatize wildlife by low-level jet fighter pilot training here? Has anyone even done an environmental analysis of what it means to have this kind of low-level flying practice over this landscape? But they also said it's endangering us and they talked about the number of women who, Innu women, who were pregnant who had miscarriages during the flying practice and so they were lying down on the airstrip to force attention, but also to stop the flying and they invited, it was very interesting, they invited me because they'd seen I'd done some stuff on bases and thinking about the impact of any base on gender relations in the town next to it.

Whatever town it is, wherever it is on the planet. How do different sorts of women living different sorts of lives in that town, how are they affected by a base? But the second thing is that they really wanted to think about Innu women's own relationship to this base and they invited, therefore, not just me. They invited, think about this, you're an Innu woman, try to, you know, not any of all of us can actually imagine being an Innu woman but do your best. You're an Innu woman, you're in Labrador, you're in Happy Valley, you are trying to protest a NATO, so it's bad enough, it's not just Ottawa it's NATO, Air Force, low-flying practice. Who else would you invite? They wisely invited a Filipina feminist. Like who in the world actually understands how you do a feminist, gender, social justice analysis of a base? Filipinas—that's who know. Filipina feminists, who are my tutors as well, Filipina feminists have thought more about military bases than just about anybody. They've organized more effectively than just about anybody about bases, and they've taught other Filipinos about bases. Let me just say at this critical moment the U.S. military is about to vastly expand their military base presence in the Philippines and Marcos Jr. has just been elected. There's a little Filipino politics here. Marcos Jr. has just been elected president of the Philippines and has agreed to this US plan for expanding the bases, all in the name of protecting Taiwan from mainland China. But back then, their choice of inviting a Filipina, I thought, I mean, it was brilliant. It was just brilliant and she, in fact, was on the exchange and she was here in Canada so came for, I think, we were all together maybe three or four days. One of the exercises they did with us was they drew, it was in a kind of a community hall, right, so there wasn't a rug, it was a just a wooden floor. They got coloured chalk, and they gave every, so we had a big space about as big as this and there weren't as many, maybe there were half as many of us, right, and they said all right, let us try to imagine every woman who is related to this base.

All right, and so I thought now, being really inspired by those Innu feminist activists, maybe we should do the same because I'm really struck. I think a lot about institutional cultures, a lot, and we've all been taught by the #metoo activists in South Korea and in Japan, in Brazil, and in India, and in Sweden, and in the US, and in Canada. We've been taught a lot about how cultures of sexual abuse get seeded, are sustained. I'm very weary of sustainability because it actually depends what you're sustaining. So, I don't use sustainability unless I add what it is I'm hoping to be sustained and what it is I think it's sustainability needs to be disrupted, right, and thinking about that, I was thinking let's think not just about the institution of the Canadian military or the Philippines military. I don't let anybody off the hook here, right, there is no military in the world that I love. So, let's think about any military but in this case the Canadian military and their relationships to all kinds of women and when, if you start thinking about their relationships with all kinds of women, what do we all understand better about the internal culture of the Canadian military? Does that make sense? That is because there's a real temptation, I love, I mean I really love blackboards, don't you? Really, I mean, aren't blackboards more fun? I mean even though you get all the white chalk all over your... I know white boards, it doesn't quite do it, does it? But anyway, they're nicely colored markers here so we can at least start off. But if you start off with the Canadian military and with all the relationships that are all gendered and all racialized and classed within the Canadian military, as we've seen over the last couple of days, you can take hours to deconstruct this and deconstruct it critically in order to change it, right. What I'm suggesting is that part of that, is not taking our eyes off this, just looking at all the other women

in the world that the Canadian military has relationships with including women in Happy Valley, Labrador.

And so, starting off, some are, of course, in the Canadian, and I'm not going to use any abbreviations, right. I don't use them when I'm talking to Pentagon people, and I try not to use them any other place because it, they become, it normalizes what's going on. I'm really, I'm really nervous about acronyms, right? I mean I fall into it you know; God knows how many committees I'm on, that are just, you know, but I try not to. Anyway, so women in the Canadian military and of course they are diverse, and they should be even more diverse. And then there are women married to, well, first of all married to male soldiers, male Canadian soldiers. But then they're also a smaller number, but definitely have to be talked about differently, right, and that is, look at all these colors, oh such fun, and that is women who are spouses of Canadian women in the military. And they are not necessarily allies, right? Maybe, maybe not. There are civilian women living next to Canadian military bases. Now, okay, watch, in Canada. Because Canadian military, of course, has been in Kandahar. The Canadian military goes on UN peace, and you'll have to educate me here about where the Canadian military has been outside of Canada. I mean, I know about Mali, but you'll have to educate me here. But this is civilian women who are, of course, diverse themselves. But Canadian women living next to Canadian military bases in Canada, at least they have an MP, right? That is not true of Canadian women, sorry, let's just say Mali, for the moment.

How many of you have actually talked to any women who live, probably some of you have, because if you've been based overseas, my guess is you've had some interaction. How many people have ever talked to women, civilian women, living around a Canadian base outside of Canada? This isn't, yeah, this is, yeah, what's it been like? Who would you have ever had a chance to talk to? Speak up a little bit so everyone can hear.

Audience member: Mostly Canadian, smaller missions such as South Sudan, Congo,...

Enloe: South Sudan, right. What gave you an occasion to be able to talk to the South Sudanese woman? Or, can you just tell about what her position was that you...

Audience member: That I was in, sure. So, I used to work for the Dallaire Institute, so General Dallaire's organisation.

Enloe: Yes.

Audience member: And working with communities affected by conflict and then armed forces working in in those communities.

Enloe: And so, what were, don't worry I won't make you, put you on, but right, this is the moment where we can teach each other, right? That is, that's the good news. So, tell us a little bit about in your job with the Dallaire Centre. What, pick one of those countries, yeah, oh good, a mic.



Audience member: Just what I wanted (laughing). If you haven't noticed I've been a little quiet.

Enloe: Yeah, yeah, no, no, come on... tell us. Give us a sense of what you learned it was like, for even if it's a little in tiny insight, for local civilian women who are living near a Canadian peacekeeping base?

Audience member: Well, it feels really strange to speak on behalf of.

Enloe: Yeah, you're not speaking on behalf of... whatever knowledge you gained.

Audience member: Sure. I think in some cases a lot of women have shared with me some protective element about having international forces close by. So, there's an element of feeling more secure and then also not feeling seen or not feeling protected at the same time. So, it's so impacted by who the people are, what the leadership structure is, who the leader of the mission is, and what that kind of culture is that's enforced in that community.

Enloe: And this happens for women living near military bases that are of their own military as well as of international peacekeeping forces, or international NATO forces, or occupying forces. And that is that real profound ambivalence around, are these forces protecting me or do I need protection from them? And in fact, the Innu women themselves in Happy Valley would have these discussions amongst themselves. The discussions were, if, as a mom, do you let your daughter date any of the pilots that come during the summer? Dating is big, right? If you're... do some of you have daughters or of an age that are dating? You know, parenting doesn't get easier, it doesn't. No. Well, now imagine that the highly masculinized force that is there is also of a different culture, is a different command structure that you have zero, zip, influence over. And then you wonder whether, and dating by the way, should definitely have quotes around it in all settings, by the way, in all settings. "Dating" is never automatically, you're smiling, I can see. "Dating" is never automatically, oh I know what dating is, because in a lot of UN peacekeeping operations, in fact, dating is food for sex. The inequalities between a peacekeeping soldier and a local 16, 18-year-old girl... the inequalities are enormous. And amongst the inequalities, it's not just age, and usually it is that the male soldier who's got some kind of, quote, let's call it "friendly" relationship with a local teenage girl. It's not only that he's older, and remember when you're 15, you can all remember when you're 15. When you're 15, somebody's four years older is really older, right. But maybe he's actually 10 years older but the other thing is, he has money, and you are in a war zone. By definition, if you have UN, Canadian, if you have UN peacekeepers in your neighborhood it means you are in a war zone, and it means you don't have secure food and you don't have a secure income and here are men who do. They both have food and money. The line between dating and sexual abuse is so, so, dot, dot, dot, dot.

And in fact, some of the most revealing, I don't know whether, well you can tell me. The United Nations now, thanks to feminists inside the United Nations, and Congolese feminists, and Somali feminists, and South Sudanese feminists, thanks to them and also Haitian feminists. Thanks to them is why we know anything about this quote "dating" militarized peacekeeping, dating inequities. It's only because they organize, they report, they do studies. They do studies of pregnancy, they do studies of financial transactions, they do studies of abuse. Most UN

peacekeeping operations have a gender focal point and according to the gender focal point people that I've talked to, UN appointed, they are almost never listened to. They are absolutely, by the way, and secondly, when they say, well look, you are in Haiti, this is a French colleague of mine who was gender focal point for the operation in Haiti, the peacekeeping operation, and she said you would know the Haitian feminists who really could get the peacekeeping operation knowledgeable about the dating, sexual abuse, transactional sex, that, abusive, that was going on. There are Haitian feminists that you can talk to and none of the officers wanted to hear that. She was talking to Haitian feminists, but the commanders of the peacekeeping operation were not talking to them. In most, so there we now know quite a lot thanks to local feminists working with transnational feminists, about the sexual abuse that goes on in peacekeeping operations. We know, we don't know enough, we never know enough, but we know a lot. How much of it is taught in Canadian academies? Are these studies, I'm not asking rhetorically, I'm asking hopefully. Are they... are any of these studies... there, yeah, no, you would know.

Audience member: We have some new curriculum for, on behalf of Canada, through the United Nations Chiefs of Defence Network on mainstreaming gender perspectives and operations, which looks at responsibility of military members within operations and they're taught about zero tolerance policies on sexual exploitation and abuse within that curriculum but I'm sad to say it hasn't been necessarily taken up within the Canadian Armed Forces at this point.

Enloe: And that means that one has to read the Filipina feminists. One has to read the Somali feminists. One has to read the Haitian feminists. They're all available in translation... you don't have to read, you know, Anglos like me. Read the people who are actually doing the work and who actually have the relationships. So, this relationship between the women living in the Canadian, in the towns where Canadian militaries are overseas, is really so important for the internal patriarchal character of the Canadian military.

One of the things we've learned from lots of different studies by Japanese feminists, of the Japanese Defence Forces, of Israeli feminists, of the Israeli Defence Forces, of the US, of Britain, of Australia, of India. We have a lot of knowledge here folks. One of the things that we've learned is, it doesn't, abusive ideas and stereotypes and presumptions about manly soldiering, particularly manly soldiering in the name of protection, that that does not stop at the water's edge. That is, whatever you all have been exploring, and I've learned so much from all of you, whatever you're exploring about this relationship doesn't stop here. In fact, sometimes it is fed by, fed by, what are the presumptions about domestic violence. And sometimes it's fed by presumptions about dating in the local towns. And sometimes it's fed by the presumptions about what goes on in South Sudan.

That is, to understand, and to tackle, and to upset, not just transform, right, we're into upsetting I think, at least. Upsetting a dysfunctional culture inside an institution cannot be done unless we think about how those distorted notions of masculinity, those distorted notions of militarized protection, play out outside the institution.

The relationship between sex work and sex workers, and I use, but I should tell you this, I use the term sex workers quite warily, ok? Because I don't want to ever presume that all women who are



in prostitution systems are simply workers. Some of them are trafficked, they are hostages, they are sex slaves. So, while this is a term that tries to add some respect, so that we actually pay close attention, and I understand why that term is very helpful, so that we have really useful conversations with women in sex work, I don't use that to cover all women who are in the prostitution industry, who aren't there because they are workers, they're there because they're hostages, and that's trafficked women.

Some of you know of the story, the revelations, the exposé, about what happened in Sarajevo, in Bosnia. But if you don't, Walter, I think you know. If you don't, let me just tell you and tell you why it matters. So, at the end of the wars in the former Yugoslavia, which were ended by a peace agreement which was hammered out on a military base, you begin to see the problem. They're called the Dayton Accords, that's the Dayton Air Force Base in Dayton Ohio all right, the Wright Air Force Base. They are now being critiqued by Bosnian feminists as one of the worst Peace Accords ever developed. There were zero, as in zero, women amongst the peace negotiators. This is the 1995 Dayton Peace Accords which are held up as a model, and look out, they're being held up to Zelensky, as the model for reconstruction of Ukraine. Bosnian feminists have gotten in touch with every Ukrainian feminist to say look out, look out, look out, if this is the template we are in really big trouble already and you're about to be in big trouble. So, they're called the Dayton Peace Accords and, just to add to your curriculum renovation, but also to all our teaching, the Bosnian feminists Nela and Gorana, who wrote the best critique I've ever seen of a peace accord, and this is of the Dayton Accord, and how is it played out in the banking system, how is it played out in the political party system, how is it played out in the schooling system, how is it played out in the, what do I want to say, in the ethno-nationalist ideological ripple effects, this is called the peace that is not. The peace, p-e-a-c-e, the peace that is not and you can find it on, some of you know the international organization called Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, wilpf.org. The peace that is not is where you can find this.

So, this is a major peace effort after a war. 1995, the UN moves in, right, and NATO. And they create police training, they create new banking systems, they bring in the IMF, I mean the whole truckload comes in to reconstruct Bosnia. After they've separated it in half ethnically so that ethno-nationalist male former fighters become the new party leaders. Perfect. Perfect. And in that setting, this is now 1996/97/98. Amongst the crucial players are contractors. We were talking about McKinsey this morning. Well, add to that Dyncorp and I'm going to write down Dyncorp up here because you should always know the names of the bad guys. Not just call them contractors when what you mean is Dyncorp. Dyncorp is one of the biggest overseas war zone contractors, US-owned. Dyncorp. So they wouldn't get sued in the movie I'm about to tell you about, they are given another name and when I've been in a movie theater several of us said at the end, when the credits were coming down, we all said Dyncorp. It's not that fake name, it's Dyncorp. So, Dyncorp got the contract to hire police to come and create the new policing system for Bosnia. That's in the name of modernizing, making more capable of protecting women from violence, all the things that Dyncorp would sell. And they came in and they were supposed to be taking domestic violence seriously and you know, teaching the Bosnians, you know, how to take, I mean it's so colonial, right? So, in the midst of this there was a woman named Kathy Bolkovac. Her parents are originally from Eastern Europe but she's out in Nevada in the US and she has just recently gotten a divorce, her pay at the Lincoln Nebraska Police Department is so low that the

court gave custody of her daughters to her ex-husband. And so she wants to make some extra money. This is real now. This is Kathy Bolkovac, she wanted to make some extra money so she could at least have joint custody of her daughters by raising her income. That's all. And she was a pretty good police officer in Lincoln, Nebraska and so she signed up for the Dyncorp contract for, you know, foreign police to train the Bosnian new police and so she came over with mostly male police trainers and, as Kathy tells it, she began to kind of notice trucks and SUVs parked outside some of the more notorious taverns. Hmm... being a good police officer she actually thought, hmm, weird. And so, she actually went into some of these bars, essentially. And she organized a raid. She got some of her other fellow officers and what she found was, this comes back to, what she found is teenage girls from Moldova and Ukraine trafficked and shackled in the back room of this Bosnian bar that was servicing, both sexually and in beverage, UN personnel. Mainly military personnel, who didn't bother to even use some other vehicle to park in front of the bar. So, Kathy was outraged, horrified, and outraged, and went in search of somebody in the UN structure in Sarajevo who would be equally outraged and help do something about the trafficking, about the complicity of both foreign police and foreign military male peacekeepers in this trafficking system. And then, you all know this because you've knocked on doors to try and find somebody in a big bureaucracy that actually takes something seriously, that you're outraged by. Mainly, the people she went, this is in the UN and NATO, the people that she reported to told Dyncorp, because Dyncorp then wanted to send her home. But she did find Madeline Rees, r-e-e-s. Madeleine Rees, this is why structure matters, you all have talked about structure. Structure matters and timing matters. By that time, by 1995, the UN has a High Commissioner for Human Rights, one of their newer positions. The High Commissioner for Human Rights and at the time that's Mary Robinson, the former president of Ireland who is also a lawyer and also a feminist. This all matters. She appointed, as her special representative, this is UN speak, her special representative to the Sarajevo mission, Madeleine Rees, who's very tall and dresses in leather. Who is a British feminist and that is Mary Robinson's UN High Commissioner for Human Rights, representative in Sarajevo and Kathy Bolkovac finally found, because you know when you're working in bureaucracies you work and work and work and maybe, maybe you find some door that will open. And she found Madeline Rees and Madeleine Rees was absolutely outraged but also knew how to use authority. And between them, they tried to hold Dyncorp to account. They tried to hold the UN officials that tried to slough it off. One UN official, and I've actually asked Madeline whether this was just in the script or is this true. One UN male official in charge of peacekeeping operations in a post-war devastated country said, "They're just whores of war." Like kind of the cannon fodder of post-war. And said, you know, like it's just normal, what do you expect, it's a, you know, it's an impoverished post-war country, what do you expect? But that's not what Madeleine Rees thought and so between them, Kathy Bolkovac and Madeline Rees, actually stirred things up, took not just the bar keepers but the Dyncorp police contract people, who were the traffickers, to court. There's a book, this is back to your curriculum, the book is called *Whistleblower*. Now there are two important books to read. One is called *The Whistleblowers* and that is blowing the whistle inside the United Nations on all kinds of abuse. So, there's *The Whistleblowers*, what is it like to be a whistleblower inside the Secretariat on the East River in New York, and there's *Whistleblower*, which is this case of trafficking. And it's been made into a movie, I would say, read the book. I saw the movie with Madeleine and a small group of people in Geneva when it just came out and when the lights came up none of us could say, I mean, there are parts you just don't watch, right, aren't there?

You just don't watch, right, yeah, I'm a total coward and, especially about the young Moldovan and Ukrainian girls. But when the lights came up, and we all sat there, about eight of us, and just sat there, and then somebody said, this is a movie now so, to Madeline, "So has Hollywood,"... I mean it's not a big Hollywood movie but it's a commercial movie, "Has Hollywood kind of made it really worse than it was?" And Madeline said, "Oh no, Kathy and I were the advisors on this movie, and we had to tone it down because it was actually much worse than this."

Now that doesn't mean that every place the Canadian military has been has had trafficked women, but never assume that women who are doing sex work are themselves there because they are working freely. Has there ever been a study of prostitution and the Canadian military? Both in Canada and in overseas? Do you know if there's any study of, there are very few by the way, of most militaries. We know more about the US and that's because of Filipina feminists and Korean feminists, that's the only reason we know so much about the U.S. military and prostitution, it's because of Filipina feminists and South Korean feminists. They're the ones who've taught us. They go on tour of the US just saying, "Wake up, wake up, do you know what your policies are?" But has there ever been a study of... any, I mean a study that finds nothing, you know, all kinds of studies. But has there ever been a study of where prostitution is, in any kind of Canadian military basing, or military overseas operation? Do you know if there's ever? Has anyone ever been curious about where both sex work, which isn't always really free labor, really, and actually trafficked sex slaves... do any of you have any idea where it is? Yeah, what do you think?

Audience member: I'm curious about it.

Enloe: Oh well, this is a start.

Audience member: I've been curious about it, and I actually took a course that Vanessa had taught about sexual exploitation and at the time, like, I had only deployed with the Navy, and I thought to myself, like, you know, we were learning that sexual exploitation doesn't occur with Canadian cultures, like, we don't do that. You know, a lot of times Canadians aren't even allowed to leave the base, let alone, you know, go interact with the public, like free, like that. And I thought to my own time in the Navy, and I was like well that's just not true because every fourth stop the guys are coming out to strip clubs.

Enloe: Strip clubs. Keep that in mind folks.

Audience member: It's interesting because we had such strict rules it sounded like in Afghanistan and overseas for the Army, but we don't have those rules at all in the Navy and I kind of wonder where we would draw the line with sexual exploitation. Obviously, we don't apply it to the Navy the same way.

Enloe: Gosh isn't that interesting. So how many of you are going to study this? No but isn't that interesting? That's really interesting and because, one of the things I mean there is also the... I'll tell you another about the Navy. I was asked to do a talk. Maya talked this morning about how do you know when you're being co-opted, right? Which is a good question to always ask, right,

complicity is such a slippery slope, right. You don't want to think you're complicit but then you become complicit. Anyway, so I had a good colleague friend named Ed Dorn, who was the highest ranking African-American appointed by President Clinton as a civilian within the defence department when Clinton was president. Ed and I had a long working relationship trying to make visible where African-American women were in the U.S. military, which are really crucial. Data point: in the 1990s, in the entire U.S. Army's enlisted women... okay, got it, think about your demographic here, okay? U.S. Army. All enlisted women. But you have to start off, like we do in Canadian studies. What percentage start off, because you're not all US demographic junkies, of all women in the US, in civilian, in the whole population, of all women in the US, what percentage of all women are African-American women? Just think one percentage of all Americans are African-Americans, then take half...

12 percent of all women in the United States. African-American women are 12 of all women just like African Americans are 12 of the whole mixed gender population. Alright? Got your 12 percent here, because if you don't know that point, you don't know whether to be surprised. In the U.S. Army, in the mid-1990s, of all women in the U.S. Army of enlisted ranks, which is the majority of women, in the enlisted ranks of the U.S. Army, you would expect then, that African-American women would be what percentage? If it was just, random? Come on, you can do it, I know you could do this.

Audience member: 12.

Enloe: 12, right! Oh this is such a sharp group. Okay. In fact, they were 48 percent. African-American women were 48 percent of all women in the enlisted ranks of the U.S. Army and nobody in the—this is about Ed Dorn, he and I would talk about this a lot—nobody in the Pentagon even cared or noticed because they weren't guys. It was African-American guys they were afraid of so they knew exactly what percentage of all men in the army were African-American because that's their fear measure. Women? Ha! Women are just women and...48 percent. So, Ed and I had worked together and he said, "Would you come and talk to recruiters?" We talked about recruiters this afternoon after the "Oka crisis" in quotes. So, I'm very interested in recruiters, very interesting recruiters and he said, "Well, we're having a big mixed branch"... with social scientists because you can't do recruiting unless you have some civilian social scientists who are willing to do studies for you so your recruiting can be more effective... "We're having a big conference in Annapolis and would you come?" I said, "Ed, only for you," I mean otherwise I'm not going to go give a talk at the Pentagon, and I said, "I can only, I keep some little teeny hold on my soul, if I get to talk about what I want to talk about." And he said, "I know you, yeah, I mean, go ahead." Ed was great, Ed Dorn, is still great. And so, I thought well here's recruiters, I'll talk about prostitution. And I apologize to begin with, and saying, "I know this isn't a topic that you usually have open discussions about but I know that all of you know a lot," and so I talked about prostitution.

Then there was a coffee break, and it was raining, I can picture this, it was raining and so nobody could really go outside and so out the hall, so it's pouring rain, and I just came over and kind of stood looking at the rain and one officer after another would come up, kind of behind me, and then have a little *unclear* whisper, and say, "Well I knew all about that but I didn't know what



to do about it because prostitution access is about you and the Navy and the ports... that's about morale." You can't tell guys they can't go to brothels or to strip clubs because a lot of strip clubs are actually acting as brothels, or discos, whatever the euphemism is in the port. You can't, they said, "I knew it was going on, I felt terrible"... and these would be mainly colonels, right, they'd be Deputy base Commanders or base Commanders and it was women and men officers who came up one right after another and just, to kind of, have a little moment of truth and discomfort. So, I think it really is worth talking about all kinds of relationships between Canadian military men and all the women in their universe. All of them.

The teenage Innu women in Labrador. The woman who has two kids to support and can't put food on the table in South Sudan. All of the women because out of that comes the behavior within the military. I don't think, two things, I think, I don't think we can talk about any forms of abusive toxic militarized masculinity just in the bubble. What is new and what you all are doing, which I think is so valuable, is that you are talking about inside the bubble, rather than just, oh it's always out there—rape and conflict, abusive prostitution, sex for food. It isn't always out there. It is sometimes inside and the causality works both ways. The causality which reinforces which. Which notions of who needs my protection and will do anything for it. It's both inside and outside. So, I so respect the work you're doing. Do it and do it big, as well as do it small. Thanks.